CHAPTER TWO

A Field Guide to American Houses by Virginia and Lee McAlster was the primary guideline followed for architectural purposes during the field work phase of this thesis. Although many excellent sources exist, this book is the most commonly used field guide for identification of style. Therefore, the McAlsters' terminology and dates are the basis for both the narrative and the website. In American Architecture, architectural historian Leland M. Roth states that "Ethos, culture, technology, and climate together helped to shape the first shelters and ceremonial enclosure made by the first humans to venture into the New World." This is no less true even after the first shelters were built. In fact, those are the essential components to any type of architectural structure or resource. Too often people are unaware of their surroundings and miss the link between history and the historical resources that helped mold that history. Mark Gelernter said it well in A History of American Architecture, "Although we all use buildings and towns every day, seldom do we consciously think about where they came from, or why they possess a particular shape or style. Buildings are so integral to our daily existence that they often retreat invisibly into the background as we concentrate on our more immediate concerns. But in many significant ways, buildings and towns help

¹ Virginia McAlester and Lee McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2005)

² Leland Roth, American Architecture (New York: Westview Press, 2001), 13.

shape our lives."³ Although this project focuses mainly on designed historical resources from 1845 to 1970, it emphasizes the need for additional research in other dimensions of Harrison County history by identifying popular vernacular architecture types and how these historical resources continue to stand in the twenty-first century.

Folk houses are the earliest type of structure according to McAlester & McAlester. Fred B. Kniffen agrees in *Folk Housing: Key to Diffusion*, arguing that folk houses tell a richly textured tale of how Americans built their country.⁴



Figure 1: Log Cabin on Womack-Crenshaw Plantation, Greenville, AL. (Historic American Building Survey: http://www.loc.gov/pictures/resource/hhh.al0042.photos.007745p/?co=h

³Mark Gelernter, A History of American Architecture (Lebanon, NH: University Press of New England, 1999), xviii.

⁴ Fred B. Kniffen, "Folk Housing: Key to Diffusion," in *Common Places*, ed. Dell Upton and John Michael Vlach, (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1986), 3.

Folk architecture contains three different types of structures: Native American; Pre-Railroad; and National. Native American includes the iconic long houses, grass shelters, hide, and stone structures of different shapes. The earliest inhabitants of Harrison County were the Caddo Indians whose structures were the first style of folk dwellings in Harrison County. Unfortunately, no known surviving structures exist. Pre-Railroad (before c.1850-c.1920 in East Texas) was the first American architecture built by European colonists and subsequent immigrants. Mostly built of log, these structures were originally square or rectangular one-unit plans.⁵ A common practice included combining two one-unit structures with a covered center passage that often later became an enclosed center hall. In East Texas these are commonly referred to as a dogtrot house (see Figure 1).



Figure 2: Trammel's Trace Cabin, Marshall, TX: Photo by Natalie Bach-Prather.

⁵ McAlester & McAlester, *A Field Guide to American Houses* (New York: Alfred A Knope, Inc., 1984), 82.

Pre-railroad structures in Harrison County were typically made from logs easily available from the forests in the county. These were built by the earliest American families who settled within the area. Trammel's Trace Cabin (see Figure 2), located within the city limits of Marshall, is one of the last early Texas frontier homes standing within Harrison County and is the oldest home in Harrison County standing on or off its original site. Built before 1842, the cabin originally stood in Smithland, a small community located in Marion County, north of Harrison County. At some point the cabin was abandoned and left undisturbed until Hobart Key Jr. discovered it in 1938 during the Antonio de Los Santos Coy Survey. A historian who had worked on numerous projects with the Texas Historical Foundation, Key moved the cabin to its present location, a lot adjacent to his home, and restored it as close to its original state as possible. No nails were used when the Cabin was built with eighteen foot long and ten inches thick pine logs, instead the space between each log was chinked with white pipe clay which is still visible today. Butterfly mortising on the log ends and beams accompanied by tee-braces provide support for the structure. The cabin was originally part of a two-room dog trot structure, typical of early Texas frontier homes. When the cabin was moved to Harrison County, only one room was in good enough condition to salvage. Its architecture reflects the subsequent stylistic updates made to vernacular architecture see on the side additions, (see Figure 2).

⁶ Key Log Cabin File, Harrison County Historical Research Library Archives.

⁷ Terry G. Jordan, *Texas Log Buildings* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1982), 10.

National homes (after c. 1850-1890) developed along railroad lines as transportation improved due to the railroad. Instead of being limited to local resources, sawmills could move their materials in bulk, which transformed log, sod, and hand-hewn dwellings, into braced-wood frame homes (see Figure 3).8 These structures became associated with specific regions such as the deep South's narrow gable-front shotgun, the Midwestern gable-front-and-wing farmhouse, the two-story I-house of the mid-Atlantic to mid-South, and the southern square pyramidal. In East Texas, many National era homes continued the dogtrot floor plan but used wood instead of logs and often grew into the deeper massed-plan, side-gabled houses. 10 The shotgun house became a popular alternative. Both of these usually have full length porches across their front façade.



Figure 2 Turner Home. Courtesy of Harrison County Historical Museum Archives.

⁸ McAlester & McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc., 1984), 89.

9 McAlester & McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 89.

A Field Guide to American Houses, 98.

¹⁰McAlester & McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 98.

Two examples of National homes in Harrison County are the Turner home in Marshall (1850) and the Bolivar in Elysian Fields (1870). Both of these homes are massed-plan, side-gabled with shed porch roofs exactly as described by McAlester & McAlester.

Although this project only addresses two of these structures, many more types of homes with this type of architecture exist throughout the county, especially in Marshall near East Texas Baptist University.

Colonial Houses (1600-1820) are directly connected to the European immigrants who brought with them the prevailing architectural styles from their native countries.

These included Postmedieval English, Dutch Colonial, French Colonial, Spanish Colonial, Georgian, Adam, and Early Classical Revival. Due to its location and the arrival date of Europeans, Harrison County has no Postmedieval English (1600-1700), Dutch Colonial (1625-c. 1840), Georgian (1700-1780), and Adam (1780-1820) architecture. French Colonial (1700-1830) architectural influences however are found in many early structures throughout the county. Identifying features of these structures include extensive gallery porches supported by slender wooden columns, steeply pitched roofs with flared eaves, and full above ground basements. After the French settled in Louisiana, this type of architecture became widely used in New Orleans. According to Leland Roth in *American Architecture*, very few of these homes exist in the deep South outside of Louisiana and many French Colonial structures did not include the full above

¹² McAlester & McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 104.

¹³ McAlester & McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 121.

ground basements. Raised basements where unique to Louisiana which provided cooling and a breezy veranda for relief from the high humidity levels. ¹⁴ The Louisiana form of the French colonial style was utilized in Harrison County and was frequently referred to



Figure 4: Fry-Barry House, Marshall, TX. Photo by Natalie Bach-Prather

as New Orleans style by preservationists such as Max Lale. Excellent examples of the influence of the French Colonial style are Magnolia Hall, the Fry-Barry (see Figure 3), and Arnot homes in Marshall, and the W. T. Scott home in Scottsville. This type of architecture is not seen very often outside of Harrison County, which leads one to believe that the proximity of Harrison County to Shreveport, Louisiana may have influenced the early-nineteenth century builders.

¹⁴ Roth. American Architecture, 45.



Figure 5 J.B. Henderson Home. Courtesy of Harrison County Historical Museum Archives

Spanish Colonial (1600-1850) architectural features include structures with twostories made of thick masonry walls of adobe brick or rubble stone with low-pitched
hipped roofs. Often times the structures included multiple external doorways leading out
to long narrow porches. This type of architecture is prevalent in West Texas, New
Mexico, and Arizona, but is rarely seen in East Texas because the Spanish did not have
permanent settlements in the region. One example that could be argued to have some
Spanish Colonial stylistic attributes is the John Barry Henderson home in Woodlawn (see
Figure 4), also referred to as the Stagecoach home. The J.B. Henderson home, built in
1844, is a two-story masonry and frame house, with the first floor made from native red
stone and the second floor made from local timber. The second floor balcony has
ornamental railing that extends the length of the house across the front façade and has
several external doorways.

¹⁵ McAlester & McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 129.



Figure 6 Monticello Courtesy of YF12s http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Monticello (accessed April 11, 2013).

Early Classical Revival architecture (1770-1850) was a precursor to Greek Revival architecture discussed later. Identifying features include an entry portico that dominates the front façade and is generally the same height of the structure, supported by columns. The structures are typically rectangular or square and containing windows along the entire front façade. The most famous example, according to McAlister & McAlister, is Monticello, Thomas Jefferson's home built in 1770. The dome, a high-style elaboration, was frequently left off of smaller structures. According to Mark Gelernter in *A History of American Architecture*, this style of architecture became immensely popular

¹⁸ McAlester & McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 169.

for government buildings during the presidency of Thomas Jefferson. 19 Leland Roth states that Jefferson was the single most influential designer of the period from 1743-1826 who, because of his political convictions, rejected English architecture, and instead embraced influences of Roman styles.²⁰



Figure 7 Andrews-Taylor Plantation. Photo by Natalie Bach-Prather.

Although this style had been superseded elsewhere by the Greek Revival in the 1830s, Harrison County lagged behind in the latest trends. Early Classical structures in Harrison County include the Henry Ware home (1851) and Edgemont (1845) in Marshall, Locust Grove (1847) in Jonesville, Mimosa Hall (1844) in Leigh, and the Fitzpatrick-Jones home (1841) and the Andrews-Taylor Plantation (1843) in Karnack.

Gelernter A History of American Architecture, 121.
 Roth, American Architecture, 131.

The next phase of stylistic development, according to the McAlesters, was the Romantic Era, which includes the Greek Revival, Gothic Revival, Italianate, Exotic Revivals, and Octagons. The Early Classical Revival architecture evolved into Greek Revival (1825-1860) architecture, prevalent in Harrison County as well as elsewhere in East Texas. Roth claims that the cultural changes in architectural manifestations during the 1820s through the 1860s were caused by many things such as the rise of a capitalist economy, expansion of the United States, and dramatic improvements in transportation that made raw materials more accessible. He also states that Greek architecture became widespread due to the association with the American reinvention of democratic government. Therefore, Greek Revival architecture became a symbol of government and power. An excellent example is the Second Bank of the United States in Philadelphia designed by William Strickland in 1824.



Figure 8 Second Bank of the United States, Philadelphia. Courtesy of Historic American Buildings Survey http://www.loc.gov/pictures/collection/hh/item/pa0875.photos.137278p/

²² Roth, American Architecture, 152.

²¹ McAleter & McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 178.

Another influence in the popularity of Greek architecture was the Greek War of Independence from the Turkish Ottoman Empire in 1822. Gelernter argues that Americans saw a parallel between the Greek fight for independence and their earlier fight against the British, hence the movement away from any type of English architecture, to the widely popular Greek architectural styles. Texans related because of the Texas Revolution and their fight for democracy, hence the reason why Greek architectural styles were so prevalent throughout Texas for so long, especially in older towns like San Augustine.



Figure 9 Cullen-Roberts House, San Augstine, TX. Courtesy of Historic American Buildings Survey http://www.loc.gov/pictures/search/?q=Greek%20Revival%20%2BTX&co=hh

²³ Gelernter, A History of American Architecture, 132.

Although Green Revival resembled Early Classical Revival, differences can be seen in the use of Greek rather than Roman columns, a cornice along the roofline, and sidelights and a transom surrounding the front door. Among Greek Revival structures have few embellishments on the outside, having instead a simple façade. Other identifying features include a gabled roof with a full-height entry porch the length of the structure supported by classical columns. Greek Revival architecture was the dominant style of American domestic architecture during the interval from 1830 to 1850 according to McAlister. They continue to note that the largest surviving concentration of Greek Revival structures are found in states that had the largest population growth during the period from 1820 to 1860, Texas being one of them due partly because of the Texas Revolution.



Figure 10 Dial-J.B. Williamson House. Photo taken by Natalie Bach-Prather.

²⁴ McAlester & McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 179.

²⁵ Gelernter, A History of American Architecture, 132.

²⁶ McAlester & McAlester. A Field Guide to American Houses, 182.

Greek Revival architecture also lasted longer in more rural areas like Harrison County, which is evident when studying Greek Revival structures within Harrison County, many of which were not completed until the 1860s and 1870s. Many of these structures were plantations which including the Samuel Scott Plantation (1869) in Marshall, the Sloan-Haynes Plantation (mid-1860s) and the Dial-Williamson home (1873) in Nesbitt.

The second Romantic style, Gothic Revival (1840-1880) was a popular domestic and commercial style elsewhere in the nation, but in Harrison County appears to have been used solely for religious structures. Gothic Revival identifying features include a steeply pitched roof with steep cross gables, which commonly include decorated and embellished trim as well as windows that extend into gables. Fancy decorative ornamentation on windows, roof-wall junctions, porches, and doors are dominant features in most Gothic Revival architecture. Another typical aspect is the one-story porch on the



Figure 11 Eaton Chapel, Galveston, TX courtesy of Historic American Buildings Survey. http://www.loc.gov/pictures/collection/hh/item/tx0004/

ground floor. ²⁷ The Gothic Revival structures within Harrison County include the Trinity Episcopal Church and the First Presbyterian Church in Marshall, and the Youree Chapel in Scottsville.

Italianate (1840-1885) features often include hipped roofs, curved arches over doors and windows along the front façade, large overhanging eaves, and small one-level covered porticos. The main areas of elaboration on Italianate structures are the windows, which tend to be long and narrow, cornices, porches, and doorways. According to Pennsylvania Historical Commission, the Gothic and Italianate styles were made popular by the architect Andrew Jackson Downing in the 1840s and 1850s. Although the Italianate was first developed as a design for country estates, it became very popular for

²⁷ McAlester & McAlester, *A Field Guide to American Houses* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1984), 197.





Figure 12 (left) Bradbury Building. Courtesy of Harrison County Research Library Archives Figure 13 (right) Elks Lodge. Courtesy of Harrison County Research Library Archives.

urban row houses and commercial buildings. ²⁸ Examples within Harrison County include the Bradbury Building (1880) and the Elks Lodge (1909) in downtown Marshall. One significant Italianate home resides within Marshall as well, the Hagerty-Harris Home built in 1889. It is a two-story brick structure with a central hall plan, low-pitched roof with two-over-two segmentally-arched double-hung windows. The front facade has bracketed eaves with double three-bay galleries with square posts. The Hagerty-Harris was the first solid brick residence built in Marshall and the first example of Italianate

²⁸ Pennsylvania Historical & Museum Commission, "Italianate Villa/Italianate Style 1840 - 1885," http://www.portal.state.pa.us/portal/server.pt/community/mid-19th century period/2386/italianate ville italianate style/293448, accessed April 18, 2013.

architecture within the city, and remains the best preserved in the county. There are no known examples of the Exotic Revivals (1835-c. 1890), such as Egyptian, Oriental, or Swiss Chalet, or Octagons (1850-1870) in Harrison County.

As rapid expansion and a boom in economy swept over America in the late 1860s and early 1870s, so did excessive wealth and spending. McAlester and McAlester claim that rapid industrialization and the growth of railroads from 1860 through 1890 had a dramatic change on American architecture. Gelernter seems to make the argument when he claimed that many personal American fortunes were accumulated during this time period including J. P. Morgan through banking, Andrew Carnegie through steel, and John D. Rockefeller through oil. People wanted to emphasize elaborate styling over function and practicality. ²⁹ Therefore, the age of Victorian architecture (1860-1900) was ushered in throughout the United States include the Second Empire, Stick, Queen Anne, Shingle, Richardsonian Romanesque, and Folk Victorian styles. There are no known examples of the Second Empire (1855-1885) in Harrison County with its distinctive mansard roofs and dormer windows.³⁰ The Stick style (1860-c.1890) too has no known examples in Harrison County although its elaborate woodwork often makes it hard to distinguish from the later Queen Anne.

The Queen Anne style (1880-1910) became the most prominent and prevalent throughout the county by the 1880s, and like Gelernter described in A History of American Architecture, and McAlester and McAlester in A Field Guide to American

Gelernter, A History of American Architecture, 168.
 McAlester & McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 241.

Houses, the shift in architecture coincided with the growth of the railroads and an influx of wealth into communities.³¹ Gelernter argues that during the late-nineteenth century the first genuinely original American architectural styles began to appear as architects began making designs that included the picturesque aspects of Gothic styling.³² As railroads expanded, the balloon frame made up of lightweight boards were easily transported, along with complex housing components from factories, such as doors, windows, roofing, and decorative detailing. This changed the box-like homes into complex and elaborate structures. Identifying features include a steeply pitched, irregular shaped roof, with a dominant front-facing gable. A partial or full-width asymmetrical porch extends along one side of the structure, usually just one level. Embellishments include, delicate spindle work along the porch supports and railing, classical columns with detailing in the corners, and ornamental gables jutting from the roof.³³ Several well preserved Queen Anne examples can be found throughout the county but the most prominent are located in Marshall and include the Ginocchio-Cook-Pedison (1886) and Weisman-Hirsch (1901) houses.

_

³¹ Gelernter, A History of American Architecture, 168. McAlester & McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 239.

³²Gelernter, A History of American Architecture, 178.

³³ McAlester & McAlester. A Field Guide to American Houses, 239.



Figure 14 Wiesman-Hirsch Home. Photograph by Natalie Bach-Prather.

The Weisman-Hirsch home is a Free Classical Queen Anne structure constructed of cypress and heart of pine, containing twelve rooms with a long central hall floor plan. At the time the structure was completed, it contained more ornamentation and styling than any other home in Marshall. The Ginocchio-Cook-Pedison home is a two-story, Queen Anne Victorian structure with Italianate detailing seen in the carved wood trim on the window and door cornices. Built with handmade bricks on site, the Ginocchio-Cook-Pedison home differed from other homes of the era in Harrison County that were wooden. ³⁵

Of the final three Victorian styles, Shingle (1880-1900), Richardsonian Romenesque (1880-1900), and Folk Victorian (c. 1870-1910), only the last has examples

³⁵ Ginocchio-Pedison Family File, Harrison County Research Library Archives.

identified during the course of this historic resources survey. The Folk Victorian was most commonly adopted through as decorative elements such as spindle porch supports and turned balustrades were added to older homes. A good example of this transformation is the Dr. Samuel Floyd Vaughan home, originally built as a simple dog-trot structure built in 1842. The second story was built in 1865, and in 1872 Dr. Samuel Floyd Vaughan added the gingerbread detailing, decorative cornices, and spindle porch supports viewable today.

As the 1900s approached, so did new variations of architecture, described by McAlester and McAlester as Eclectic (1880-1940), which often derived from historic European styles, as well as new, originally American designs.³⁷ These styles include three subgroups, the first of which is Anglo-American, English, and French Period Houses: Colonial Revival; Neoclassical; Tudor; Chateauesque; Beaux Arts; and French Eclectic. Colonial Revival (1880-1955) structures are most often modeled after the eighteenth-century Georgian, Adam, and Dutch. In Marshall, the headquarters of the Chamber of Commerce since 1971 is a beautiful rendition of Georgian architecture completed in 1926 by the architect J. W. Northrup, Jr.³⁸ Other examples of Colonial Revival architecture in Harrison County include the Winston Taylor home (1941) in Waskom, and the Fitzpatrick-Jones home (1929) in Karnack.

_

³⁶ McAlester & McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 309-310.

³⁷ McAlester & McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 319.

³⁸ Chamber of Commerce File, Harrison County Research Library Archives.



Figure 15 Winsotn-Taylor Home. Photo by Natalie Bach-Prather.

Preservation activities elsewhere in the nation, such as those at Colonial Williamsburg including the 1931-1934 reconstruction of the Governor's Palace, also popularized the Colonial Revival style.



Figure 16 Governor's Palace. Courtesy of Larry Pieniazek, http://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Colonial_Williamsburg_Governors_Palace_Front_Dscn7232.jpg (accessed April 11, 2013).

The Neoclassical style (1895-1950) became best-known after the World's Columbian Exposition, held in Chicago in 1893 which mandated a classical theme, therefore, the architects designed dramatic colonnaded buildings with facades dominated by classical columns and symmetrically balanced windows. Soon after the Exposition, this style became the latest fashion throughout the country although it was usually reserved for monumental buildings or large homes. Two examples of large homes found in Marshall are the Starr-McGee home (1930) and the Raguet-Recknagle home (1938). The old post office building in Marshall is an example of a civic, Neoclassical building, constructed in 1915. The building was transformed into the U.S. Sam B. Hall Federal Courthouse in 1963.

³⁹McAlester & McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 346.



Figure 17 Sam B. Federal Courthouse. Photo by Natalie Bach-Prather.

The Tudor style (1890-1940) with its steeply pitched roof, half-timbering, and decorative brickwork, was very popular in East Texas and can be seen scattered throughout Harrison County. The Williams house, located in Marshall and built in 1929, is a well preserved example within Harrison County that perfectly portrays the aspects of Tudor architecture. It is a simple two-story brick structure with a prominent front chimney that contains three flues capped with chimney pots and is situated tight against a single front gable. There are no known examples of the Chateauesque (1880-1910) or French Eclectic (1915-1945) styles and very few Beaux Arts (1885-1930) structures. One of the single most architecturally significant structures in the county is the (old) Harrison County Courthouse designed by James Riely Gordon in 1900 in the

⁴¹ McAlester & McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 355.

Beaux Arts style. 42 Gordon is well known throughout Texas for his beautiful architecture. A recent book was just published about his structures by Chris Meister, titled *James Riely Gordan: His Courthouse and Other Public Architecture*.

The second subgroup of the McAlesters' Eclectic period is the Mediterranean Period Houses: Italian Renaissance (1890-1935), Mission (1890-1920), Spanish Eclectic (1915-1940), Monterey (1925-1955), and Pueblo Revival (1910-present). The third set is Modern: Prairie (1900-1920), Craftsman (1905-1930), Modernistic (1920-1940) which includes both Art Modern and Art Deco, and, lastly, International (1925-present). For the most part this survey does not include a large number of structures from any of these styles because they were not a focus of previous preservation work. Secondly, there was not time to fully survey what is a much larger segment of the extant built environment than the previous two centuries combined. However, there are examples of these styles as well as the McAlesters' last phase of Since 1940: Modern (c. 1935-present) which includes Minimal Traditional, Ranch, Split-Level, Contemporary, and Shed; Neoeclectic (c. 1965-present) which includes Mansard, Neocolonial, Neo-French, Neo-Tudor, Neo-Mediterranean, Neoclassical Revival, and Neo-Victorian; and Contemporary Folk (c. 1940-present) structures such as Mobile Homes, Quonset Huts, A-Frames, and Geodesic Domes. While surveying, it became clear that there are many types of modern architecture that can be seen throughout Harrison County, such as the Marshall Hawley Motor Company first built in 1911, then later remodeled in 1991, the Coca Cola bottling

⁴² Building On Our History (Marshall: The Courthouse Preservation Council of Harrison County, 2002), 20.

plant (1920) located in Marshall, the Hotel Marshall built in 1929, new additions to East Texas Baptist University throughout the 2000s, Wiley College, and the new Marshall courthouse built in 1964.



Figure 18 Coca-Cola Bottling Company. Photograph by Natalie Bach-Prather

There is clearly much work to still be done in order to identify and preserve the historic resources that tell a wider breadth and depth of Harrison County history. The Harrison County Historical Resources Survey is a starting point and provides up-to-date information on previously research structures mainly within the nineteenth and early twentieth century's. But little has been completed on later resources in the twentieth century, and virtually nothing has been done on twenty-first historical resources. This survey will provide future preservationists with a guideline on how to continue

conducting similar survey's within the county and a map to historical resources that have yet to be researched and included.